AURES PROJECT

Interactive policy tool Lessons learnt and best practices on implementing auctions in Europe & beyond

Silvana Tiedemann

ECOFYS

A Navigant Company

Overview

Auction tools of the AURES' project





Overview

- Auction tools of the AURES' project
- The auction design process in context





Overview

- Auction tools of the AURES' project
- The auction design process in context





Auction tools

http://auresproject.eu/

AUCTION TOOLS

- 1. The "About Auctions" overview and glossary
- 2. The cash flow model simulating single investment appraisals
- 3. The policy memos
- The AURES Auction Designer
- 5. The AURES Auction Academy webinars

TOOLBOX >>





Auction tools

http://auresproject.eu/

AUCTION TOOLS

- 1. The "About Auctions" overview and glossary
- 2. The cash flow model simulating single investment appraisals
- 3. The policy memos
- The AURES Auction Designer
- 5. The AURES Auction Academy webinars

TOOLBOX >>





Auction Design Elements





Auction Design Elements

Auction Criteria

Auction Scope

Auction format

Pricing rules

Remuneration

Other Design elements





Auction Design Elements

Auction Criteria: price, actor diversity, geographical distribution, domestic industry development, system integration, technical specifications

Auction Scope: auction volume, periodicity, target achievement safeguards

Auction format: static, dynamic, hybrid

Pricing rules: first-price and second-price, uniform-pricing and pay-as-bid, English and Dutch, ascending- and descending-clock

Remuneration: duration of contract, FIT, fixed FIP, sliding FIP, investment grant

Other Design elements: ceiling prices (reservation prices), material pre-qualifications, financial pre-qualifications, additional penalties, bidder restrictions





Auction Design Elements

Auction Criteria: price, actor diversity, geographical distribution, domestic industry development, system integration, technical specifications

Auction Scope: auction volume, periodicity, target achievement safeguards

Auction format: static, dynamic, hybrid

Pricing rules: first-price and second-price, uniform-pricing and pay-as-bid, English and Dutch, ascending- and descending-clock

Remuneration: duration of contract, FIT, fixed FIP, sliding FIP, investment grant

Other Design elements: ceiling prices (reservation prices), material pre-qualifications, financial pre-qualifications, additional penalties, bidder restrictions



Related concepts, challenges, and effects



Auction Design Elements

Auction Criteria: price, actor diversity, geographical distribution, domestic industry development, system integration, technical specifications

Auction Scope: auction volume, periodicity, target achievement safeguards

Auction format: static, dynamic, hybrid

Pricing rules: first-price and second-price, uniform-pricing and pay-as-bid, English and Dutch, ascending- and descending-clock

Remuneration: duration of contract, FIT, fixed FIP, sliding FIP, investment grant

Other Design elements: ceiling prices (reservation prices), material pre-qualifications, financial pre-qualifications, additional penalties, bidder restrictions



Related concepts, challenges, and effects

Bid bonds, bidding strategy



Auction Design Elements

Auction Criteria: price, actor diversity, geographical distribution, domestic industry development, system integration, technical specifications

Auction Scope: auction volume, periodicity, target achievement safeguards

Auction format: static, dynamic, hybrid

Pricing rules: first-price and second-price, uniform-pricing and pay-as-bid, English and Dutch, ascending- and descending-clock

Remuneration: duration of contract, FIT, fixed FIP, sliding FIP, investment grant

Other Design elements: ceiling prices (reservation prices), material pre-qualifications, financial pre-qualifications, additional penalties, bidder restrictions

Related concepts, challenges, and effects

Administrative costs, allocative efficiency Bid bonds, bidding strategy **C**learing price **D**eadlines and grace periods, dynamic efficiency Economies of scale Implicit collusion, incentive compatibility Local content Multi-project bidders **NIMBY S**tatic efficiency, strategic supply reduction, sunk costs Transaction costs Underbidding Winner's curse















 Free online tool for policy makers designed by Fraunhofer ISI







- Free online tool for policy makers designed by Fraunhofer ISI
- Introduces you to the most important questions of auction design







- Free online tool for policy makers designed by Fraunhofer ISI
- Introduces you to the most important questions of auction design
- Tailors AURES' lessons learnt to your usage case



SOCIO-

POLITICAL

ACCEPTABILITY

Support cost minimisation



ALLOCATIVE

EFFICIENCY

Number of

participating low cost projects

Awarding lowest

cost projects











SUMMARY: COUNTRY: N/A TECHNOLOGY: N/A SUPPLY/DEMAND RATIO: N/A FORMAT: N/A TYPE: N/A PRICING RULE: N/A PAYMENT: N/A

SHOW ALL

Design your renewable electricity auction

Are you a policy maker interested in allocating support for renewable energy installations via auctions? Do you want to understand which are the most common auctions for renewable energy support? Do you need to know more about which auction design has which effects on auction performance?

The **AURES Auction Designer** is a free online tool developed by the <u>AURES</u> <u>project</u>. It takes you through the most important questions which need to be answered by anyone trying to set up a successful renewable energy auction. The tool is interactive. Feel free to skip between the questions, try out

different options, and play around with different design elements to observe their effects.

However, keep in mind that you will obtain the most useful feedback if you enter realistic answers. Therefore, if you want to prepare your data first, download our <u>info sheet</u> with background information and a list of the questions you will be asked when going through the tool.

	_	_	_	_	_	_	_		_				
п	o	o	s	e	а	С	o	u	п	τ	Г	v	

Select

Continue

 \checkmark







SUMMARY: COUNTRY: N/A TECHNOLOGY: N/A SUPPLY/DEMAND RATIO: N/A FORMAT: N/A TYPE: N/A PRICING RULE: N/A PAYMENT: N/A

SHOW ALL

Design your renewable electricity auction

Are you a policy maker interested in allocating support for renewable energy installations via auctions? Do you want to understand which are the most common auctions for renewable energy support? Do you need to know more about which auction design has which effects on auction performance?

The **AURES Auction Designer** is a free online tool developed by the <u>AURES</u> <u>project</u>. It takes you through the most important questions which need to be answered by anyone trying to set up a successful renewable energy auction. The tool is interactive. Feel free to skip between the questions, try out

different options, and play around with different design elements to observe their effects.

However, keep in mind that you will obtain the most useful feedback if you enter realistic answers. Therefore, if you want to prepare your data first, download our <u>info sheet</u> with background information and a list of the questions you will be asked when going through the tool.

Choose a country	
Select	
	Continue







SUMMARY: COUNTRY: N/A TECHNOLOGY: N/A SUPPLY/DEMAND RATIO: N/A FORMAT: N/A TYPE: N/A PRICII

Design your renewable electricity auction

Are you a policy maker interested in allocating support for renewable energy installations via auctions? Do you want to understand which are the most common auctions for renewable energy support? Do you need to know more about which auction design has which effects on auction performance?

The **AURES Auction Designer** is a free online tool developed by the <u>AURES</u> <u>project</u>. It takes you through the most important questions which need to be answered by anyone trying to set up a successful renewable energy auction. The tool is interactive. Feel free to skip between the questions, try out



Lithuania







SUMMARY: COUNTRY: LITHUANIA TECHNOLOG	Y: ONSHORE WIN	ID SUPPLY	//DEMAND	ratio: <mark>n/</mark>	A FORMA	T: N/A TY	(PE: N/A	PRICING	RULE: N/A	PAYMEN	T: N/A	SHOW ALL
	Total	Biogas	Biomass	Geo- thermal	Hydro (Iarge)	Hydro (small)	PV	CSP	Tide/Wav	Onshore wind	Offshore wind	
Installed capacity 2014 [MW] ?	576	78	26	0	90	27	69	0	-	288	0	
NREAP planned capacity 2020 [MW] ?	874,8	62	162	0	100,8	40	10	0	0	500	0	













	Multiple technology	Biogas (> 1 MW)	Biomass (> 1 MW)	Geo- thermal (> 1	Hydro (> 10 MW)	Hydro (> 1 MW)	PV (> 1 MW)	CSP (> 1 MW)	Tide/Wav (> 1 MW)	Onshore (> 1 MW)	Offshore (> 1 MW)	Small plants (< 1
Select a technology for which you want to explore auction designs ?	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•		•	•	•
Deployment target [MW] in the next 5 years ?	300											
Number of auctions during the next 5 years ?	5											
Volume per auction [MW] ?	70											
Expected market potential per auction [MW] ?	80											
Return to											Cont	









The volumes you enter here will determine the demand you create by your auction scheme. The ratio of supply versus demand in your market is crucial to the result of your auction.

70

Continue to FORMAT



Return to

START











A Navigant Company



Select a technology for which

Auction volume determined in terms of budget (€)

When the target volume of an auction is set in terms of a ma auctioned good is usually either expressed in terms of genera Bidders therefore either commit to delivering a certain amou generation over the contract duration, or to installing a certai a given realisation deadline.

A budget target volume clearly sets an upper limit for suppor providing security on policy costs for the regulator, and ultim consumers. However, with a budget cap it is unclear ex-ante be installed as a result of each auction round. This makes pla system more difficult. It also means that the achievement of are usually expressed in terms of installed capacities or share production) is more difficult to monitor. This can mean both u overachievement of policy targets. Budget caps are thus less deduced from existing policy targets and must be constantly readjusted according to technology cost developments.



e Netherlands Italy, and the UK have used budget-bas rejects was defined in terms of capacity in all cases.

How is the auction volume defined?

Report D4.1-NL, March 2016

Auctions for Renewable Energy Support in the Netherlands: Instruments and lessons learnt

🖸 📗 HORIZ 🎱 N 2020

ECOFYS A Navigant Company

budget.

alled











Multi-technology auctions

Which auction format works best for which technology?

Two basic types of auctions are regularly applied to allocate support for renewable energy installations: **Single-item auctions** and **multiple-item auctions**.

You chose technology-specific auctions for **Onshore Wind**. For this technology, several projects are usually required to fulfil the target. Lead times for project development tend to be relatively short, and a large number of potential projects may be in the project pipeline at any given time.

Project sites are usually available in areas with grid infrastructure. **Multiple-item** auctions are likely to be a suitable choice in this case.

Technology-specific multiple-item auctions are being or have been used in <u>Germany</u>, <u>France</u>, <u>Denmark</u>, <u>Portugal</u>, <u>Italy</u>, and <u>South Africa</u>.

Select your preferred auction format O Single-item

Multiple-item





1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
START	ESSENTIALS	FORMAT	BIDDERS	TYPE	PRICING	PAYMENT	DESIGN	SUMMARY

UMMARY: COUNTRY: LITHUANIA TECHNOLOGY: ONSH	ORE WIND SUPPLY/DEMAND RATIO: 1.1:1 FORMAT: MULTIPLE-ITEM TYPE: N/A PRICING RULE: N/A PAYMENT: N/A	SHOW AL
Why do you need to know this?	The characteristics of your bidders and your auctioneer are important, for example when choosing between static and dynamic auction types. In addition, the better you know your bidders, the more reliable your estimate on competition levels will be, and the better you can foresee possible problems with auction performance. You can then address such issues with appropriate design measures.	
Expected number of bidders ?	 Less than 5 Between 5 and 50 More than 50 	
Do bidders (project developers) have good cost information on their projects? ?	No	
Is there a risk of implicit collusion? ?	No	
Can the auctioneer handle a complex auction mechanism?	No	
Return to FORMAT		Continue to TYPE





Type, pricing, payment



Select your preferred auction type	 Static Dynamic





Type, pricing, payment



Select your	preferred	auction type
-------------	-----------	--------------

Select your preferred pricing rule



Uniform pricing with highest accepted bid

- Uniform pricing with lowest rejected bid
- Pay-as-bid





Type, pricing, payment



Select your preferred auction type

Select your preferred pricing rule

Select your type of support payment

• Static

O Dynamic

○ Uniform pricing with highest accepted bid

Uniform pricing with lowest rejected bid

Pay-as-bid

Feed-in tariff

Fixed feed-in premium

Sliding feed-in premium

Investment grant













Secondary objectives

Design elements

Vary the design elements below to observe their effect on auction performance.

Ceiling prices 🕮 Read more ambitious none Material Prequalifications 🛄 Read more lenient strict Financial Pregualifications 🚇 Read more lenient strict Penalties 🛄 Read more lenient strict Bidder restrictions 🛄 Read more NO tight loose

Actor Diversit	y 🖵 Read more
No	~
Geographical	distribution 🛱 Read more
Contingents f	or certain location types c
Domestic indu	istry development 🛱 Read
Domestic indu more	istry development 🖾 Read
Domestic indu more Pre-qualificati	istry development (2) Read
Domestic indu more Pre-qualificati	istry development (2) Read on criterion regarding job

Which criteria, apart from prices, are important to








γo

Design elements

Vary the design elements below to observe their effect on auction performance.



🔅 ΛURES

Material prequalification

Material prequalifications help bidders to gain a better understanding of the costs of their project. You have chosen strict material prequalification, thus the bidders have good information on project costs. Good cost information increases the quality of the bids, and reduces the uncertainty for the bidders. Strict material prequalifications therefore improve realisation rates. When project costs are rather certain, which is implied by strict prequalification requirements, bidders are unlikely to underbid. This may increase overall support costs.

Material prequalifications result in <u>sunk cost</u> for bidders. The higher the material prequalification, the higher the sunk costs and the more bidders choose not to participate. While high sunk costs generally only filter out weak bidders, strict material prequalification can make the sunk cost so high that also strong bidders choose not to participate in the auction. This may also contribute to increasing overall support costs. Thus, be aware that strict material pre-qualifications will decrease supply in your auction. Keep in mind that your supply-demand ratio was **1.1:1** earlier and should not decrease much further if you want sufficient competition. Consider decreasing the auction volume if you are unsure whether supply will still be high enough.







Secondary objectives

you in your auction?

Which criteria, apart from prices, are important to

~

~

 \checkmark

Design elements

Vary the design elements below to observe their effect on auction performance.

Ceiling prices 🛄 Read more Actor Diversity 🛄 Read more No ambitious none Material Prequalifications 🛄 Read more Geographical distribution 🚇 Read more Contingents for certain location types c lenient strict Financial Pregualifications 🚇 Read more Domestic industry development 🚇 Read more Pre-qualification criterion regarding job lenient strict Penalties 🛄 Read more System integration 🛄 Read more No strict lenient Bidder restrictions 🛄 Read more Technical specifications 🚇 Read more (No tight loose

SOCIO-	ALLOCATIVE				
ACCEPTABILITY	EFFICIENCY				
Accept Ability Support cost minimisation Awarding of favoured projects	Awarding lowest cost projects Number of participating low cost projects Participating				
Realisation rate	amounts (MW)				
EFFECTIVENESS					
Read explanation for dimensions in	n chart				







Design elements

Vary the design elements below to observe their effect on auction performance.

Ceiling prices 🛱 Read more	Actor Diversity 🛱 Read mor
	No
none am	itious
Material Prequalifications 🛱	Read more Geographical distribution
	Contingents for certain location
lenient s	rict
Financial Prequalifications 🛱	Read more Domestic industry developm more
lenient s	Pre-qualification criterion rega
Penalties 🛱 Read more	System integration 🛱 Read
	No
lenient s	rict
Bidder restrictions 🛱 Read mo	re Technical specifications 🛱
	No
loose	ght

Secondary objectives Which criteria, apart from prices, are important to you in your auction?

~ Read more on types c 🗸 ent 🛄 Read arding job 🗸 more \checkmark

Read more \checkmark Design elements Vary the design elements below to observe their effect on auction performance.

Secondary objectives

Which criteria, apart from prices, are important to you in your auction?





ECOFYS A Navigant Company

























• Where to find:

http://auresproject.eu/auctiondesigner







• Where to find:

http://auresproject.eu/auctiondesigner

- When to use:
 - To get an overview on design choices you will face
 - To get a feel for the implications of different design options which are discussed in your country







• Where to find:

http://auresproject.eu/auctiondesigner

- When to use:
 - To get an overview on design choices you will face
 - To get a feel for the implications of different design options which are discussed in your country
- When **not** to use:
 - Don't mistake the Auction Designer's for a silver bullet delivering a ready-made auction design





Overview

- Auction tools of the AURES' project
- The auction design process in context

























(Technology specific) RE targets









Market &				
regulatory				
analysis				





• Market size: level of expected competition sufficient?





- Market size: level of expected competition sufficient?
- Market players: IPPs, international/domestic, existing or newcomers?





- Market size: level of expected competition sufficient?
- Market players: IPPs, international/domestic, existing or newcomers?
- Technology cost: expected budget claims, ceiling prices based on LCOE analysis, value of RES





- Market size: level of expected competition sufficient?
- Market players: IPPs, international/domestic, existing or newcomers?
- Technology cost: expected budget claims, ceiling prices based on LCOE analysis, value of RES
- **Project development phases**: duration, risks of project failure, required documentation, costs





- Market size: level of expected competition sufficient?
- Market players: IPPs, international/domestic, existing or newcomers?
- Technology cost: expected budget claims, ceiling prices based on LCOE analysis, value of RES
- **Project development phases**: duration, risks of project failure, required documentation, costs
- Existing regulations & incentives: land rights; permitting (construction, generation, grid connection, import licenses; regulation for international companies, financing, ...)





- Market size: level of expected competition sufficient?
- Market players: IPPs, international/domestic, existing or newcomers?
- Technology cost: expected budget claims, ceiling prices based on LCOE analysis, value of RES
- **Project development phases**: duration, risks of project failure, required documentation, costs
- Existing regulations & incentives: land rights; permitting (construction, generation, grid connection, import licenses; regulation for international companies, financing, ...)
- Available grid capacity: administratively site selection?, conflicts with grid development plans by TSO/state-owned utility/local or regional government bodies?





- Market size: level of expected competition sufficient?
- Market players: IPPs, international/domestic, existing or newcomers?
- Technology cost: expected budget claims, ceiling prices based on LCOE analysis, value of RES
- **Project development phases**: duration, risks of project failure, required documentation, costs
- Existing regulations & incentives: land rights; permitting (construction, generation, grid connection, import licenses; regulation for international companies, financing, ...)
- Available grid capacity: administratively site selection?, conflicts with grid development plans by TSO/state-owned utility/local or regional government bodies?
- Electricity market design: Accessibility, risk profile for investors, reliability









• Who drafts the auction regulation?





- Who drafts the auction regulation?
- Who carries out the auction?





- Who drafts the auction regulation?
- Who carries out the auction?
- Who oversees issuing permits/licenses?





- Who drafts the auction regulation?
- Who carries out the auction?
- Who oversees issuing permits/licenses?
- Who commissions the awarded projects?





- Who drafts the auction regulation?
- Who carries out the auction?
- Who oversees issuing permits/licenses?
- Who commissions the awarded projects?
- Who pays awarded projects (contract offtaker)?



















Prepare formal regulation, participation documents, and PPAs





✓ Prepare formal regulation, participation documents, and PPAs

Ensure bidders understand the tender documents (transparency and simplicity)





- Prepare formal regulation, participation documents, and PPAs
- Ensure bidders understand the tender documents (transparency and simplicity)
- ✓Make a legal review of documents





Imple-			
mentation			

Drafting of required documents Market building		Auction conduction				
	Market	Auc	Auction			
	building	Announce- ment	Bid evaluation	Results		






✓ Publish tender documents well ahead of auction deadline, to give bidders sufficient time to prepare their bids

- ✓ Ensure that auction platform works properly
- Evaluate and award bids as quickly as possible without compromising on reliability
- \checkmark Announce when to announce winners
- ✓ Announce results publicly
- ✓ Be prepared for legal disputes







✓ Publish tender documents well ahead of auction deadline, to give bidders sufficient time to prepare their bids

- ✓ Ensure that auction platform works properly
- Evaluate and award bids as quickly as possible without compromising on reliability
- ✓Announce when to announce winners
- ✓Announce results publicly
- ✓ Be prepared for legal disputes





Imple-
mentation

Drafting of required	Market	Auction conduction			
		Auc	Auction		Contracting
documents	building	Announce-	Bid	Results	
		ment	evaluation	Results	







 Contract awarded bidders or monitor contracting by third party







 Contract awarded bidders or monitor contracting by third party

✓ Have provisions for project retirement in place







 Contract awarded bidders or monitor contracting by third party

- ✓ Have provisions for project retirement in place
- ✓ Be prepared for legal disputes





The auction design itself is only a small part of the auction design process







The auction design itself is only a small part of the auction design process







• AURES identified bestpractices for renewable energy auction design





- AURES identified bestpractices for renewable energy auction design
- Findings are available in accessible formats





- AURES identified bestpractices for renewable energy auction design
- Findings are available in accessible formats







- AURES identified bestpractices for renewable energy auction design
- Findings are available in accessible formats
- The process of auction design is as important as the design itself







Contact

Ecofys Germany GmbH

Albrechtstr. 10c

10117 Berlin

Germany

T: +49 (0)30 297 735 79-0

info@ecofys.com

Silvana Tiedemann

E: <u>s.tiedemann@ecofys.com</u>

I: www.ecofys.com / www.navigant.com





AURES

Project coordination:

Communication and web:

Lena Kitzing

Researcher

Frederiksborgvej 399

DK-4000 Roskilde

lkit@dtu.dk

+45 24 65 90 64

Poul Erik Morthorst

Professor Frederiksborgvej 399 DK-4000 Roskilde pemo@dtu.dk +45 46 77 51 06 Michael Minter Head of Secretariat Kattesundet 4, 3rd floor DK-1458 København K mm@concito.dk + 45 26 16 64 14

Visit our website: www.auresproject.eu

Follow AURES on Twitter @AURESproject

###