Unbundling and Certification - Lessons Learnt

Dr. Rozeta Karova
Senior Energy Lawyer, Energy Community Secretariat
1. TSO unbundling & certification in the EU
2. Legal basis in the Energy Community
3. TEP – status quo in the Contracting Parties
4. TSOs unbundling in the Contracting Parties
5. Energy Community experience
1. **Rationale**: To ensure independence of electricity and gas transmission services from generation, production, and supply in order to increase competition in energy markets.

   - Directive 2009/73/EC concerning common rules for the internal market in natural gas
   - Directive 2009/72/EC concerning common rules for the internal market in electricity

3. **Choice from three models of unbundling**
   - Ownership unbundling (OU)
   - Independent System Operator (ISO)
   - Independent Transmission Operator (ITO)
## Unbundling Options

### Comparison

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ownership Unbundling</th>
<th>(A) owner (assets)</th>
<th>(B) operation (technical and commercial)</th>
<th>investment decision</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>acts as TSO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;&gt; independent from</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>supply/production</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISO</td>
<td>assets remain with</td>
<td>ISO (acting as TSO)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;&gt; legal &amp; functional</td>
<td>vertically</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unbundling</td>
<td>integrated company</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;&gt; independent from</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>production &amp; supply</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt;&gt; ownership</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>unbundled from (A)</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITO</td>
<td>ITO</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt;&gt; independent from</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>vertically</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>integrated company</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(assets, management,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>supervisory board)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ministerial Council Decision 2011/02/MC-EnC, 6 October 2011

- Adopted & adapted the Third Energy Package in the Energy Community
- Deadline for Contracting Parties to transpose and apply - 1 January 2015
- Deadline for TSOs unbundling – 1 June 2016

* Except: Moldova – derogation for gas – 1.1.2020
  Georgia – joined EnC 24 April 2017
Third Package Transposition in Contracting Parties (I)

- Albania: Electricity (5), Gas (5)
- BiH: Electricity (4), Gas (1)
- Kosovo*: Electricity (5), Gas (5)
- fyrMacedonia: Electricity (3), Gas (2)

Workshop on European Energy Law, 4 May 2017, Vienna
### Third Package Transposition in Contracting Parties (2)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Electricity</th>
<th>Gas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montenegro</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Workshop on European Energy Law, 4 May 2017, Vienna
## TSOs Unbundling in the Contracting Parties (I)
### State of play

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CP</th>
<th>AL</th>
<th>BiH</th>
<th>KS</th>
<th>MK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity</td>
<td>OST ou certified</td>
<td>• NOS BiH (system operator) &amp; Transco no unbundling &amp; certification envisaged</td>
<td>KOSTT ou (law) Gov to control KEK and Parliament - KOSTT)</td>
<td>MEPSO no law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gas</td>
<td>TAP ITO certified, Albgaz applied for ou to ERE</td>
<td>• BH Gas (F BiH) • Sarajevo-gas Istocno Sarajevo (RS) • Gas Promet no 2pck unbundling</td>
<td>No TSO ou (law) – future TSO</td>
<td>GAMA –only licensed TC no law</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## TSOs Unbundling in the Contracting Parties (II)

### State of play

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CP</th>
<th>MD</th>
<th>MNE</th>
<th>SR</th>
<th>UA</th>
<th>GE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sector</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity</td>
<td>Moldelectrica ou <em>(law)</em></td>
<td>CGES ou <em>(law)</em></td>
<td>EMS <em>ou – in process</em></td>
<td>Ukrenergo ou <em>(law)</em></td>
<td><em>GSE</em> • <em>Sakrusenergo</em> • <em>Energotrans</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gas</td>
<td>• Moldovatransgaz</td>
<td>No TSO ou <em>(law)</em> – future TSO</td>
<td>• Yugorosgaz Transport ISO in process • Srbijagas all three models <em>(law)</em> no 2pck unbundling</td>
<td>Ukrtransgaz ou and ISO <em>(law)</em></td>
<td>Georgian Gas Transportation Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Vestmoldtransgaz all three models <em>(law)</em> 1.1.2020</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EnC experience with unbundling/certification so far (I)

Two certified TSOs (I)

- **TAP**
  - pipeline project aimed to transport the gas from Azerbaijan to European gas markets via Greece, Albania and Italy
  - Certification followed up regulatory decision (joint AL, GR, IT – June 2013) exempting the project from certain provisions of the TEP (including ou) and imposing ITO

**ECS Opinion 1/16** (3 Feb 2016) – on ERE‘s preliminary decision, taking into account EU COM Opinion on GR & IT decisions

**ECS agreed with certification of TAP AG and invited ERE to open a new certification procedure once TAP becomes operational**
EnC experience with unbundling/certification so far
Two certified TSOs (II)

**OST – AL electricity TSO**

**ECS Opinion 1/17** (23 Jan 2017) – on ERE’s preliminary decision

**ECS agreed with certification of OST subject to several conditions and invited ERE to elaborate on and monitor OST’s continuous compliance with unbundling**

**Issue**: separation of control over transmission and generation/supply - 2 Ministries
- CoM approval of new interconnectors upon proposal of the Ministry of Energy;
- Ministry of Energy’s right to give an opinion to ERE in relation to TYNDP

**ERE adopted final decision** - 15 March 2017:
- in 12m TSO to present proof of primary and secondary legislation amendments regarding the transfer of the competences of the Ministry of Energy and Industry to the Ministry of Economy
- In 3m appoint Compliance officer and compliance program

✓ **ENTSO-E accepted OST as a full member** – 30 March 2017
**EnC experience with unbundling/certification so far**

Two certification procedures in progress

- **Yugorosgaz – SR gas TSO**

  **ECS Opinion 2/17** (22 April 2017) – on AERS’s preliminary decision

  **ECS concluded that Yugorosgaz-Transport is currently not able to operate the system effectively and independently from the system owner Yugorosgaz and considers that it can currently not be certified as envisaged by the Preliminary Decision.**

  **Issue**: TSO still directly and indirectly controlled by persons active in production and/or supply of natural gas or electricity, does not have required resources for carrying out its tasks as TSO, does not have the ability to comply with all TSO’s tasks and obligations independently. The owner- *Yugorosgaz* does not comply with unbundling requirements. No Art.11 risk assessment performed.

  AERS to adopt final decision taking into account ECS Opinion.

- **EMS – SR electricity TSO** - ECS Opinion due by 15 June 2017
Ongoing activities & follow-ups...

- **Unbundling plans**
  - **Naftogaz unbundling**
    CoM Naftogaz Unbundling Plan (July 2016): delay in implementing OU
    *main challenge* - define an efficient way for transferring transmission & storage assets and staff, putting in place necessary legal framework for the transfer
  - **CGES electricity TSO** (Montenegro)
    TA (under Connectivity project / WB6) to MNE NRA in certification procedure

- **Other CPs** – significant delays => *infringements under Energy Community Dispute Settlement Rules to follow*
Lessons learnt

- **Certification of TSOs – procedure and timeline in EnC**
  - notification by TSO to national TSO
  - draft NRA decision in 4m => notified *immediately* to ECS
  - ECRB gives opinion to ECS; ECS gives its opinion to NRA in 4m from notification
  - NRA adopts final decision (utmost account of ECS opinion) in 2m from ECS Opinion

**Strict deadlines** => unbundling model to be chosen while law drafting changes in legal, admin., reg. framework other than energy-related

- **Assistance & (in)formal consultations with ECS**
  - close cooperation and informal exchange on challenging issues
  - advice & advanced (potential) problems solving
  - public hearings organised by ECS – clarifying open issues
  - TA – independent consultants/experts involvement
  - EU experience / COM Opinions followed

...
Thank you for your attention!

www.energy-community.org